

# On some criteria of irrationality for series of positive rationals : A survey

Catalin BADEA\*

URA 751 au CNRS & UFR de Mathématiques  
Université de Lille I, F-59655 Villeneuve d'Ascq, France

*Dédié à la mémoire de Roger Apéry*

## Abstract

This paper is an English and expanded version of a talk delivered at the “Rencontre Arithmétique de Caen”, June 1995, dedicated to the memory of Roger Apéry. It is a survey of some general irrationality criteria and other irrationality results. The emphasis is on irrationality of reciprocals of binary recursive sequences and on an open problem of P. Erdős concerning the so-called Sylvester sequence.

**1991 Mathematical Subject Classification** : 11J72, 11J81, 11B37.

**Keywords** : irrational numbers, irrationality criteria, Fibonacci numbers, linear recurrences, transcendental numbers.

---

\*e-mail address : [badea@gat.univ-lille1.fr](mailto:badea@gat.univ-lille1.fr)

# 1 Introduction

There are several known conditions for an infinite convergent series of positive rational numbers to have an irrational (or transcendental) sum. There are also other results about the irrationality or transcendence of particular constants expressed as series of positive rationals. In general, it seems to be hopeless to obtain general irrationality criteria which are sufficiently strong to imply the irrationality of many particular constants.

R. Apéry's wonderful proof [2] of the irrationality of  $\zeta(3)$  belongs to the second class. The aim of this paper is to survey some of the general criteria of irrationality and to discuss some irrationality and transcendence results, mainly about series of reciprocals of binary recursive sequences. The only place when we will cite again Apéry's name will be in the next section, when we will mention a result due to André-Jeannin [3]. He used Apéry's method in order to prove the irrationality of the series of reciprocals of Fibonacci numbers. Speaking about Apéry's method, it would be fair to see his proof as belonging to the middle class of particular irrationality assertions yielding some new ideas for irrationality proofs, although we cannot speak yet of Apéry's criterion of irrationality. We refer to [8] and [18] for several developments of Apéry's method.

The irrationality and the transcendence of series of reciprocals of binary recursive sequences is discussed in the third section, while the particular case of Fibonacci and Lucas numbers is considered in the next one. In the last section we deal with some general irrationality criteria related to a conjecture of P. Erdős.

We will make two conventions. The first one is that all series which appear are supposed to be convergent. The second one is the following. Let  $(a_n), n \geq 0$ , be a sequence of complex numbers and  $(s_h), h \geq 0$ , be a strictly increasing sequence of integers. When writing

$$\sum_{h=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a_{s_h}},$$

we will understand that the sum is in fact taken over those  $h$  with  $s_h \geq 0$  and  $a_{s_h} \neq 0$ .

## 2 Sums of reciprocals of Fibonacci and Lucas numbers.

Let  $(F_n), n \geq 0$ , be the Fibonacci sequence, defined by

$$F_0 = 0, F_1 = 1, F_{n+1} = F_n + F_{n-1} \quad (n \geq 1).$$

We define the Lucas sequence by

$$L_n = F_{n-1} + F_{n+1}.$$

Using R. Apéry's method, André-Jeannin [3] proved in 1989 that the series of reciprocals of Fibonacci numbers is an irrational number :

$$\theta_0 = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_n} \notin \mathbf{Q}.$$

In fact, in [3] there is a more general result implying also the irrationality of reciprocals of more general recursive sequences (cf. the next section). Recently, Bundschuh and Väänänen [14] obtained an irrationality measure for  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_n}$ . Namely, one has :

$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_n} = -\frac{5 + \sqrt{5}}{2} L_q\left(\frac{1 + \sqrt{5}}{2}\right)$$

where  $q = -(3 + \sqrt{5})/2 \in \mathbf{Q}(\sqrt{5})$  and

$$zL_q(-z) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^n}{q^n - 1} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{z}{q^n - z}$$

and, using this, they obtained  $6/(1 - (3/\pi^2)) \approx 8.62\dots$  as a measure of irrationality for  $\theta_0$ . We refer to [14] for the details. We still don't know if  $\theta_0$  is a transcendental number.

Surprising facts are known if the sum is taken not over the whole sequence. For instance, we have

$$\theta_1 = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_{2^n}} = \frac{7 - \sqrt{5}}{2} \in \mathbf{Q}(\sqrt{5})$$

(cf. Good [28], Hoggatt and Bicknell [34], [35], and Cuculière [19]). Therefore  $\theta_1$  is algebraic. The transcendence of

$$\theta_2 = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n!F_{2^n}}$$

was proved independently by Mignotte [44] and Mahler [42].

P. Erdős and R.L. Graham [23, pp. 64-65] have raised, among many problems, the following ones :

A. *What is the character of*

$$\theta_3 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_{2^{n+1}}} \quad \text{and} \quad \theta_4 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{L_{2^n}} ?$$

B. *Is it true that if  $(n(k)), k \geq 1$ , is a sequence of positive integers such that there exists a constant  $c > 1$  with  $n(k+1)/n(k) \geq c$  for every  $k$ , then the sum of the sum of the series  $\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{F_{n(k)}}$  is irrational ?*

The author [5] proved that  $\theta_3$  and  $\theta_4$  are irrational, while Bundschuh and Pethö [13] showed that  $\theta_3$  is transcendental. André-Jeannin [4] proved that  $\theta_4 \notin \mathbf{Q}(\sqrt{5})$ . Recently, Becker and Töpfer [11] proved a general theorem (see later) implying that  $\theta_3$  and  $\theta_4$  are transcendental.

For the second part of the Erdős-Graham's problem, we know [6] the affirmative answer for  $c \geq 2$ . We will return to this problem in the next section.

### 3 Sums of reciprocals of binary recursive sequences

Let  $P$  and  $Q$  be two coprime integers. Let  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  be the roots of the equation  $x^2 - Px + Q = 0$ . Consider the binary recursive sequences  $U_n = U_n(P, Q)$  and  $V_n = V_n(P, Q)$  defined, respectively, by

$$U_n = \frac{\alpha^n - \beta^n}{\alpha - \beta} \quad \text{and} \quad V_n = \alpha^n + \beta^n, \quad n \geq 0.$$

Then  $U_{n+2} = PU_{n+1} - QU_n$ ,  $n \geq 0$ , and the same recurrence relation holds for  $V_n$ .

The following formula was obtained in 1878 by Lucas [41, p. 225] :

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{Q^{2^{n-1}r}}{U_{2^{n_r}}} = \frac{\beta^r}{U_r}, \quad r \geq 1.$$

This implies that

$$\Theta_0 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{U_{2^{2^n}}} \notin \mathbf{Q}$$

whenever  $Q = \pm 1$  and  $\Delta = P^2 - 4Q > 0$ . Indeed,  $U_r$  and  $V_r$  are integers,  $\alpha - \beta$  is irrational and  $\beta^r = (V_r - U_r(\alpha - \beta))/2$  is irrational. Many special cases of this result were re-discovered in the seventies. As we will see a little bit later, Becker and Töpfer [11] showed that algebraic numbers of this kind belong to a explicitly given exceptional set.

In the above section, we mentioned that the second Erdős-Graham's problem for Fibonacci numbers has a positive solution for  $c \geq 2$ . In fact [6],

$$\Theta_1 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{U_{n(k)}} \notin \mathbf{Q}$$

whenever  $n(k+1) \geq 2n(k) - 1$  for all sufficiently large  $k$  for  $P > 0$  and  $Q < 0$ . Wayne McDaniel [43] assumed that  $\Delta > 0$  and proved that  $\Theta_1$  is irrational if  $n(k+1) \geq 2n(k)$  for large  $k$ , for all sequences  $U_n$  with  $P > 0$ ,  $(P, Q) = 1$  and  $P^2 - 4Q > 0$ . He also proved that if  $n(k+1) \geq 2n(k) - 1$  for all large  $k$  and  $n(k)$  is even, then the result holds for all such positive parameters  $P$  and  $Q$ . Similar results hold for the sequences  $V_n$ . André-Jeannin [4] has shown that, if  $P > 0$  and  $Q = \pm 1$ , then

$$\Theta_2 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{U_n} \notin \mathbf{Q}.$$

The following result was proved recently by Becker and Töpfer [10]: we have

$$\Theta_3 = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{\varepsilon^n}{V_{2^n}} \notin \mathbf{Q}$$

whenever  $\varepsilon = \pm 1$ , the roots  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  are distinct, not necessarily real,  $|\alpha| \geq |\beta|$ , and  $\alpha/\beta$  is not a root of unity. In fact, if  $\Delta > 0$ , not a perfect square,  $\Theta_3$  is even a transcendental number [11]. In the same paper, the authors were able to carry out a complete study of similar transcendence problems for binary recursive sequences with irreducible companion polynomial of positive discriminant. The proofs are based upon Mahler's method for transcendence.

**Theorem 1 (Becker and Töpfer [11])** *Let  $(R_n)$ ,  $n \geq 0$ , be a sequence of integers which is not eventually periodic and satisfies the recurrence relation*

$$R_{n+2} = PR_{n+1} - QR_n \quad (n \geq 0) ,$$

*with integers  $P$  and  $Q$  satisfying  $P \neq 0$ ,  $\Delta = P^2 - 4Q > 0$ . Suppose that  $\Delta$  is not a perfect square.*

*Let  $(b_h)$ ,  $h \geq 0$ , be a periodic sequence of algebraic numbers which is not identically zero and let  $d$ ,  $k$ , and  $l$  be integers with  $d \geq 2$  and  $k \geq 1$ .*

*Then*

$$\Theta_4 = \sum_{h=0}^{\infty} \frac{b_h}{R_{d^h k + l}}$$

*is algebraic if and only if  $(b_h)$  is a constant sequence,  $d = 2$ ,  $|Q| = 1$ , and  $R_l = 0$ . Moreover, if  $\Theta_4$  is algebraic, then  $\Theta_4 b_0^{-1} \in \mathbf{Q}(\sqrt{\Delta}) \setminus \mathbf{Q}$ .*

For other results of this type, we refer the interested reader to [38], [40], [45], [13], [31], [10], [11].

## 4 The Sylvester sequence and a problem of Erdős

In proposition 20 of Book IX of his *Elements*, Euclid gave a proof like the following that there are infinitely many primes. Suppose that  $p_1, \dots, p_n$  are all the primes we know about. Let

$$P_n = \prod_{i=1}^n p_i .$$

Then  $1 + P_n$  is not divisible by any of the primes  $p_1, \dots, p_n$ , so the prime factors of  $1 + P_n$  are new to us. Hence, the number of primes is unbounded. If we “discover” just the smallest prime factor of  $1 + P_n$  and if we begin with 2, then we are lead in a natural way to the sequence

$$2, 3, 7, 43, 13, \text{ etc.}$$

Shanks [53] has conjectured that this sequence contains all primes and he gave a heuristic argument which makes this conjecture plausible. For this

and other similar Euclid sequences we also refer to Guy and Nowakowski [30] and Wagstaff [58].

If one feels that *all* prime factors of 1 plus the product of those found so far are “discovered”, then one is lead to the sequence

$$S_1 = 2, S_{n+1} = 1 + S_1 \cdots S_n.$$

The terms of this sequence can be computed without any factoring since

$$S_{n+1} = S_n^2 - S_n + 1 = S_n(S_n - 1) + 1 .$$

We refer to Guy and Nowakowski [30] and Odoni [46] (and the references cited therein) for the study of the primes of this sequence.

It seems that this sequence (#331 in [54]) was first mentioned by J.J. Sylvester in 1880 [55], although some authors attribute it to E. Lucas. We will call it the *Sylvester sequence*. It may be worthwhile to mention that the Sylvester sequence appears in many different contexts : see the list of references for several of the many papers mentioning the Sylvester sequence.

For irrationality assertions, the following greedy property of the Sylvester sequence may be important : for each  $N$ , the first  $N$  terms of the Sylvester sequence are known [37], [20], [36] to give the smallest positive value of

$$1 - \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{1}{a_i}$$

among all choices of positive integers  $a_1, \dots, a_N$ . In particular, the sum

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{S_n} = 1$$

is rational. The following open problem due to Erdős conjectures that this is essentially the only possibility among sequences satisfying  $a_{n+1}/a_n^2 \sim 1$ .

**Conjecture 2 (Erdős [23])** *Let  $(a_n), n \geq 1$ , be a sequence of positive integers such that*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{a_{n+1}}{a_n^2} = 1.$$

*Then,*

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{a_n} \in \mathbf{Q}$$

implies  $a_{n+1} = a_n^2 - a_n + 1$  for all large  $n$ .

The following are some partial results towards this conjecture.

**Theorem 3 (Erdős and Straus [24])** *Let  $(a_n), n \geq 1$ , be an increasing sequence of positive integers such that*

1.  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n^2/a_{n+1} \leq 1$  ;
2. *the sequence  $[a_1, \dots, a_n]/a_{n+1}$  is bounded.*

*Then the same conclusion as in Conjecture 4.1 holds.*

In the above theorem,  $[a_1, \dots, a_n]$  denotes the least common multiple of  $a_1, \dots, a_n$ .

The following result is a consequence of a more general result [6].

**Theorem 4 ([6])** *Let  $(a_n), n \geq 1$ , be a sequence of positive integers such that*

$$a_{n+1} \geq a_n^2 - a_n + 1.$$

*Then the same conclusion as in Conjecture 4.1 holds.*

A generalization of this result to irrationality of series of rationals can be found in [6], while a generalization of Erdős-Straus's result to more general series was obtained by Oppenheim [48]. A similar result holds for infinite products [47].

The following variation of Theorem 4.2 can be proved.

**Theorem 5 ([7])** *Let  $(a_n), n \geq 1$ , be an increasing sequence of positive integers such that*

1.  $a_n^2/a_{n+1} \geq 1$  ;
2.  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left( \frac{a_n^2}{a_{n+1}} - 1 \right) < \infty$ .

*Then the same conclusion as in Conjecture 4.1 holds.*



If one admits also alternating series, then we should mention that

$$C_0 = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^{n+1}}{S_n}$$

is transcendental. Therefore, Cahen's [15] constant

$$C = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^{n+1}}{S_n - 1}$$

is also a transcendental number since  $2C = C_0 + 1$ . These results were first proved by Davison and Shallit [21], [52], who also obtained their continued fractions development. Note that  $C$  was also mentioned by Remez [49] and that the transcendency of Cahen's constant was also proved, as a corollary of a more general result, by Becker [9]. A transcendency measure for  $C$  was recently obtained by Töpfer [57].

**Acknowledgments.** The author would like to thank the organizers of the conference for their kind invitation and support. He would also like to thank R. André-Jeannin, P.-G. Becker, F. Beukers, P. Bundschuh and R.W.K. Odoni for their help.

## References

- [1] A.V. Aho ; N.J.A. Sloane : *Some doubly exponential sequences*, Fibonacci Quart. **11**(1973), 429-437.
- [2] R. Apéry : *Irrationalité de  $\zeta(2)$  et  $\zeta(3)$* , Astérisque (S.M.F.) **61**(1979), 11-13.
- [3] R. André-Jeannin : *Irrationalité de la somme des inverses de certaines suites récurrentes*, C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris, Sér. I Math. **308**(1989), 539-541.
- [4] R. André-Jeannin : *A note on the irrationality of certain Lucas infinite series*, Fibonacci Quart. **29**(1991), 132-136.
- [5] C. Badea : *The irrationality of certain infinite series*, Glasgow Math. J. **29**(1987), 221-228.

- [6] C. Badea : *A theorem on irrationality of infinite series and applications*, Acta Arith. **63**(1993), 313-323.
- [7] C. Badea : *in preparation*.
- [8] C. Batut ; M. Olivier : *Sur l'accélération de la convergence de certaines fractions continues*, Séminaire de Théorie des Nombres de Bordeaux, 1979-1980, no. 23.
- [9] P.-G. Becker : *Algebraic independence of the values of certain series by Mahler's method*, Monatsh. Math. **114**(1992), 183-198.
- [10] P.-G. Becker ; T. Töpfer : *Irrationality results for reciprocal sums of certain Lucas numbers*, Arch. Math. (Basel) **62**(1994), 300-305.
- [11] P.-G. Becker ; T. Töpfer : *Transcendence results for sums of reciprocals of linear recurrences*, Math. Nachr. **168**(1994), 5-17.
- [12] L. Brenton ; R. Hill : *On the diophantine equation  $1 = \sum \frac{1}{n_i} + \frac{1}{\prod n_i}$  and a class of homologically trivial complex surface singularities*, Pacific J. Math. **133**(1988), 41-67.
- [13] P. Bundschuh ; A. Pethö : *Zur Transzendenz gewisser Reihen*, Monatsh. Math. **104**(1987), 199-223.
- [14] P. Bundschuh ; K. Väänänen : *Arithmetical investigations of a certain infinite product*, Compos. Math. **91**(1994), 175-199.
- [15] E. Cahen : *Note sur un développement des quantités numériques, qui présente quelque analogie avec celui en fractions continues*, Nouvelles Ann. de Math. **10**(1891), 508-514.
- [16] Z. Cao ; R. Liu ; L. Zhang : *On the equation  $\sum_{j=1}^s (1/x_j + 1/(x_1 \cdots x_s)) = 1$  and Zná'm's problem*, J. Number Th. **27**(1987), 206-211.
- [17] R.D. Carmichael : *Diophantine Analysis*, J. Wiley & Sons, New York 1915.
- [18] H. Cohen : *Accélération de la convergence de certaines recurrences linéaires*, Séminaire de Théorie des Nombres de Bordeaux, novembre 1980.

- [19] R. Cuculière : *Problem E 2922*, Amer. Math. Monthly **89**(1982),63 ; solution, ibid. **91**(1984), 435.
- [20] D. Curtiss : *On Kellogg's diophantine problem*, Amer. Math. Monthly **29**(1922), 380-387.
- [21] J.L. Davison ; J.O. Shallit : *Continued fractions for some alternating series*, Monatsh. Math. **111**(1991), 119-126.
- [22] P. Erdős : *Az  $\frac{1}{x_1} + \dots + \frac{1}{x_n} = \frac{a}{b}$  egyenlet egész számú megoldásairól*, Mat. Lapok **1**(1950), 192-210.
- [23] P. Erdős ; R.L. Graham : *Old and New Problems and Results in Combinatorial Number Theory*, Monograph. Enseign. Math. **28**, Genève 1980.
- [24] P. Erdős ; E. G. Straus : *On the irrationality of certain Ahmes series*, J. Indian Math. Soc. **27**(1963), 129-133.
- [25] J.N. Franklin ; S.W. Golomb : *A function-theoretic approach to the study of nonlinear recurring sequences*, Pacific J. Math. **56**(1975), 455-468.
- [26] S.W. Golomb : *On the sum of the reciprocals of the Fermat numbers and related irrationalities*, Canad. J. Math. **15**(1963), 475-478.
- [27] S.W. Golomb : *On certain nonlinear recurring sequences*, Amer. Math. Monthly **70**(1963), 403-405.
- [28] I.J. Good : *A reciprocal series of Fibonacci numbers*, Fibonacci Quart. **12**(1974), 346.
- [29] W.E. Greig : *On sums of Fibonacci-type reciprocals*, Fibonacci Quart. **15**(1977), 356-358.
- [30] R.K. Guy ; R. Nowakowski : *Discovering primes with Euclid*, Delta **5**(1975), 49-63.
- [31] P. Hančl ; P. Kiss : *On reciprocal sums of series of linear recurrences*, Math. Slovaca **43**(1993), 31-37.
- [32] D. Hanson : *On the product of the primes*, Canad. Math. Bull. **15**(1975), 33-37.

- [33] D. Hensley : *Lattice vertex polytopes with few interior lattice points*, Pacific J. Math. **105**(1983), 183-191.
- [34] V.E. Hoggatt, Jr. ; M. Bicknell : *A primer for the Fibonacci numbers, Part XV : Variations on summing a series of reciprocals of Fibonacci numbers*, Fibonacci Quart. **14**(1976), 272-276.
- [35] V.E. Hoggatt, Jr. ; M. Bicknell : *A reciprocal series of Fibonacci numbers with subscripts  $2^nk$* , Fibonacci Quart. **14**(1976), 453-455.
- [36] D.M. Johannessen ; T.V. Søhus : *On strambrøker*, Nord. Mat. Tidsskr. **22**(1974), 103-107.
- [37] O.D. Kellogg : *On a diophantine problem*, Amer. Math. Monthly **28**(1921), 300-303.
- [38] L. Kuipers : *An irrational sum*, Southeast Asian Bull. Math. **1**(1977), 20-21.
- [39] J.C. Lagarias ; G.M. Ziegler : *Bounds for lattice polytopes containing a fixed number of interior points in a sublattice*, Canad. J. Math.
- [40] V. Laohakosol : *A counterexample to Schmidt's conjecture*, Southeast Asian Bull. Math. **4**(1980), 48-49.
- [41] E. Lucas : *Théorie des fonctions numériques simplement périodiques*, Amer. J. Math. **1**(1878), 184-240.
- [42] K. Mahler : *On the transcendency of the solutions of a special class of functional equations*, Bull. Austral. Math. Soc. **13**(1975), 389-410.
- [43] W.L. McDaniel : *The irrationality of certain series whose terms are reciprocals of Lucas sequence terms*, Fibonacci Quart. **32**(1994), 346-351.
- [44] M. Mignotte : *Quelques problèmes d'effectivité en théorie des nombres*, Thèse de doctorat, 1974.
- [45] M. Mignotte : *An application of W. Schmidt's theorem. Transcendental numbers and golden number*, Fibonacci Quart. **15**(1977), 15-16.

- [46] R.W.K. Odoni : *On the prime divisors of the sequence  $w_{n+1} = 1 + w_1 \cdots w_n$* , J. London Math. Soc. **32**(1995), 1-11.
- [47] A. Oppenheim : *The irrationality or rationality of certain infinite series*, in : Studies in Pure Math. (presented to R. Rado), (L. Mirsky, ed.), pp. 195-201, Academic Press, London 1971.
- [48] A. Oppenheim : *The irrationality of certain infinite products*, J. London Math. Soc. **43**(1986), 115-118.
- [49] E. Ya. Remez : *On series with alternating signs which may be connected with two algorithms of M.V. Ostrogradskii for the approximation of irrational numbers*[Russian], Uspekhi Mat. Nauk **6**(no. 5)(1951), 33-42.
- [50] H.E. Salzer : *The approximation of numbers as sums of reciprocals*, Amer. Math. Monthly **54**(1947), 135-142.
- [51] H.E. Salzer : *Further remarks on the approximation of numbers as sums of reciprocals*, Amer. Math. Monthly **55**(1948), 350-356.
- [52] J.O. Shallit : *Sylvester's sequence and the transcendence of Cahen's constant*, in : Math. Heritage of C.F. Gauss (Th.M. Rassias, ed.), World Sci. Publ., Hong-Kong 1993.
- [53] D. Shanks : *Euclid's primes*, Bull. Inst. Combinatorics and its Appl. **1**(1991), 33-36.
- [54] N.J.A. Sloane : *A Handbook of Integer Sequences*, Academic Press, New York 1973.
- [55] J.J. Sylvester : *On a point in the theory of vulgar fractions*, Amer. J. Math. **3**(1880), 332-335 ; *Postscript* : 388-389.
- [56] T. Takenouchi : *On an indeterminate equation*, Proc. Phys.-Math. Soc. Japan **3**(1921), 78-92.
- [57] T. Töpfer : *Algebraic independence of the values of generalized Mahler functions*, Acta Arith. **70**(1995), 161-181.
- [58] S.S. Wagstaff, Jr. : *Computing Euclid's primes*, Bull. Inst. Combinatorics and its Appl. **8**(1993), 23-32.

- [59] J. Zaks ; M.A. Perles ; J.M. Wills : *On lattice polytopes having interior lattice points*, Elem. Math. **37**(1982), 44-46.